Introduction

The Iberian peninsula is replete with myths. In the north, pilgrims crossed remote mountains, and followed a sacred topography populated by pious hermits and holy bishops. Prodigious monuments bore witness to a glorious Visigothic past, which inspired a tiny band of crusaders to fight for repossession of the land for over half a millennium. In the northeast, Catalonia sat apart, linked politically and artistically to Europe. A barren no-man's land occupied the centre until the arrival of Christian settlers. In the south, al-Andalus was a paradise of luxury and tolerance, where Christians, Jews, and Muslims lived together in harmony (*convivencia*). Like most myths, these narratives contain a few grains of truth, but they have also obscured much of the literature on Spanish and Portuguese art.[1] For those who work on Romanesque art the language of the pilgrimage road and of the *reconquista* remains an issue, despite repeated efforts to employ new approaches and clear rejection of the methodologies of early-twentieth-century historiography. Likewise historians and art historians have proposed convincing alternatives to *convivencia*. Building on such work, this book aims to provide a revisionist survey of Spanish and Portuguese art and architecture from the Roman conquest to the late eleventh century. It cannot, and is not intended to, replace earlier surveys that describe all aspects of buildings and objects in great detail. Instead it brings together

information from diverse sources – documentary, archaeological, and art historical – to present new narrative contexts and to highlight some important case studies. As its main subject is connections, and above all exchange across the supposed north-south divide, this book uses a cartographic framework. For generations lines on maps have bedevilled study of this art and architecture.[2] They have infiltrated the popular imagination and have come to dominate the ways that most people think about medieval Spain and Portugal. One impetus behind this book is to diminish the power of these lines by setting them within a wider and deeper network. The pilgrimage-road map is an image of influence. It comprises four 'pilgrimage' roads that come down through France – and it is always down and not up – to converge south of the Pyrenees at Puente la Reina. From there, a single road winds its way horizontally east-west across the north of the peninsula until it reaches its destination, Santiago de Compostela. These familiar linear marks bring with them the intellectual debates and assumptions of the last hundred years. They embody the nineteenth-century and early twentieth-century idea that French artistic invention repeatedly marched down the roads and into Spain where it was received. This is perhaps best summed up by Emile Mâle's claim that 'civilisation came into Spain along the Way of Saint James', an idea that was influenced

1   For the myths of Spanish Romanesque historiography, see Castiñeiras, 2008b, 86-107.

2   Ingold, 2007, 72-103.

by Bédier's work on medieval literature.[3] In the 1920s the pioneering art historian Arthur Kingsley Porter vigorously opposed the direction of Mâle's model.[4] Yet he also believed in the pilgrimage roads as routes of transmission and that 'medieval sculptural influences, like medieval poetry, knew no nationality borders but were fluid like the pilgrims who travelled to Santiago de Compostela'. The image that this conjures of the medieval artist wandering the road like a troubadour continues to hide in the assumptions of more recent research, and 'pilgrimage-road' sculpture remains a much-used phrase. The arguments of Mâle and Porter crystallized into the 'Spain or Toulouse' debate on the origins of Romanesque sculpture, which still troubles the work of many later scholars, for all that they declare that they no longer believe in this opposition.

The *reconquista* map is an image of division. It represents an advancing border as the 'reconquest' is seen to gather pace in a uniform and progressive manner that moves southwards down the peninsula. The areas labelled 'Christian' on the maps become incrementally larger, whilst those marked 'Muslim' shrink. The first in a series of maps typically draws a thin line along the north of the Spanish peninsula to indicate territory left to the surviving Visigoths and Hispano-Romans when the Arabs and Berbers invaded in 711. A second map usually demarcates the area north of the Duero river to show progress made by the Christians in reclaiming land by the mid-tenth century. The land to the south of the river Duero, but north of the Muslim caliphate of al-Andalus, is often shaded grey to suggest a buffer zone and an area of depopulation. Maps that show the position in the late eleventh century, after King Alfonso VI's conquest of Toledo in

1085, absorb most of that buffer zone into the kingdom of León and Castile. The divisions on these maps reflect some historical realities, identifying land claimed at specific times and strategic sites when they changed hands. However, lines cannot adequately reflect the cultural, economic, and political links between the kingdoms. They serve only to reinforce the supposed bipolarity between Christians and Muslims and to establish religious, or confessional, difference as the only one that matters. Scholars in the field have argued for many years that religious difference was not necessarily the most important identifier at the time, at least not before the twelfth century. They have shown how alliances were forged between Muslim and Christian; that Christian fought Christian, and Muslim fought Muslim, just as often as they opposed one another on the basis of faith. It has become clear that diplomacy, trade, and warfare operated along very different routes with little regard for official boundaries even where those existed. Frontier studies have helped to address these issues but have also perpetuated the dividing line in the very act of challenging it. All too often their models derive from studies of frontiers in the 'wild west' of America that sit strangely alongside the historical realities of medieval Spain. In any event scholars' nuanced arguments have so far failed to re-draw the delimited categories of Muslim and Christian that continue to be embodied in these maps. One impetus behind this book was to find a way to diminish the power of those cartographic images. To some extent that has been done by providing a richer, more layered, geographic and historical framework for the buildings and their contents, but this cannot counter the more memorable lines.

In approaching this challenge I looked for a physical and intellectual topography that would have the visual immediacy of the pilgrimage and *reconquista* maps but would

3   Mâle, 1978, 302; Bédier, 1908-12.
4   Porter, 1924, 3-25.

also open out the full range of possibilities for artistic exchange across the peninsula. I chose the structure of the Roman roads of Hispania. The roads criss-cross the peninsula, working with the coast and with the major rivers to provide a historically authentic way of linking the regions without denying their distinctive identities. I am aware that the choice of a road system, which can be seen as a marker of Roman imperialism, is potentially difficult because of its nationalist associations in recent Spanish and Portuguese history. On the other hand, it is important to note that there is considerable current interest in the Roman heritage that attempts to set aside those ahistorical associations. Nor were the Romans writing on a blank sheet. Phoenicians, Greeks, and Celtiberians had colonised the land long before the Roman conquest and many of the Roman roads used routes previously established, but the Romans consolidated them, improved them, and recorded them. The roads that run through the Spanish and Portuguese landscape interact with its geography and geology to form a range of topographies – sacred, economic, and political – which are important at every stage in this study.[5] The schema also preserves a north-south view of communication, one that is not cut off by boundary lines separating Christians and Muslims. The network of Roman roads also provided a framework for the field trips that made this book possible, as they followed each of the Roman roads. Despite the neglect that the roads suffered during certain periods, the routes continued to be the main arteries of communication even in difficult times, and modern tarmacadam roads tend to run close to the routes of these ancient tracks. This first-hand experience of the landscape highlighted the importance of the juxtaposition

of sites, or the distance between them, their position in the landscape, and the relationship to mountains, water, quarries, and other resources. Following the roads also imposed a discipline that lessened the danger of over-privileging monuments that have been at the centre of long-standing art historical debates. It also reduced the risk of overlooking sites or objects omitted from, or marginalised by, those debates. Where major sites were located off the roads these were still included, with a special note of any remote locations. Throughout the period, wealth, whether gained as tribute, as booty through raiding, through ransom payments, through taxes on land or trade, or in the form of diplomatic gifts, moved around this nexus of roads. The availability of such wealth, sustained or sporadic, may often have been the determining factor in the decision to build or to craft a work of art. The form of the wealth, gold, silver or other precious materials – or perhaps in the form of skilled labour – may have determined the result.

There are further advantages to starting with the Roman period and working through the vertical layers to the early Romanesque. All the cultures that developed in Spain after the Roman period were accretive. People continued to repair, re-use, and re-invent Roman buildings and infrastructure at different dates and even at different locations. Some of the most useful examples, and often the hardest to assess, occur where architectural or decorative elements have been extracted from earlier layers and reused in later contexts. Some were plundered for mainly pragmatic reasons; others gained more complex meanings when they were incorporated as *spolia* in later structures. This process persisted and indeed renewed itself, as ninth- and tenth-century masons and sculptors in the north and the south of the peninsula looked back to works produced not only in antiquity but also in the

---

5   For the geography of art, see Kaufmann, 2004, 17-104.

intervening periods. Ultimately they shared an artistic vocabulary and varied it in ways that reflected complex political and social realities. Awareness of, and admiration for, the art of Byzantium informed much of the production. In the north some objects were even crafted to look like *spolia,* creating a mesmerizing mix of preserved pieces and archaizing new carvings, whilst at the same time interacting with developments in al-Andalus. Although it could be said that continuity in the sense of artistic language and sometimes materials is an important element in this book, it is not intended to imply homogeneity of production at any period or geographical location, and, just as importantly, does not suggest continuity of expertise. As some Spanish scholars have emphasized, it was not possible to revive Roman or late antique techniques merely by studying their surviving results. The artisans who appear to have done this most likely brought the expertise from al-Andalus, where it had been largely imported and fostered.

None of this is separable from the people who inhabited, visited, or controlled these places. Their interaction with the specific physical environment created a strong sense of place for each site. Their selection of location moulded the landscape. The terrain and the locally available stone and men to work it often determined the art and architecture that was created. In other notable cases some of the materials or the artists were very likely imported. Sometimes these importations had far-reaching effects, but others apparently remained one-off phenomena. Although individuals, families, and communities often developed their identities within a site, town, or region, it is important not to underestimate the extent to which people travelled throughout the periods under consideration, regardless of the effort and physical danger sometimes involved. A wide range of social supra-geographical networks overlaid

the everyday routes of communication across the peninsula, including those of the now elusive Jewish communities. Some are visible because they related to the identities of institutions, often ecclesiastical or monastic, whilst others drew on less predictable personal connections. The latter can occasionally illuminate otherwise distant and inexplicable parallels, both within and beyond the peninsula.

At every stage in this study the status of the artists, their freedom of movement, and their likely training will be born in mind before any consideration of their religious affiliation. Very little is known about the organisation of labour between the end of the Roman Empire and the late Middle Ages. Even so there is no doubt that slavery played a role, and in Córdoba the caliph owned slaves who were highly accomplished ivory carvers.[6] Unfree men in the caliphate could hold important positions, and ivory and silk were high status materials. Family workshops that used less precious materials may not have been under the same kind of caliphal control and could trade on their own behalf, albeit within some kind of regulatory framework. There is also evidence for slaves at the Christian royal courts and in monasteries, although it is less clear how many were high-level craftsmen.[7] As elsewhere in Europe, documentary evidence for the employment of craftsmen, contracts, and the payment of wages, let alone guilds, does not appear until the twelfth century.[8] Before that, there is only circumstantial evidence for the kind of bonds that both protected and controlled artisans, especially those with exceptional skills. Few historians have followed Pierre Bonnassie in thinking that 'classical' slavery ended with the arrival of feudalism *c.* 1000, and instead have focussed mostly on the

6   Rio, 2006, 7-40.
7   Hitchcock, 2008, 69-74.
8   Epstein, 1991, 50.

social implications of unfreedom.[9] The possible repercussions for the production of art into the eleventh century have as yet received little attention. But the commonly held image of the independent artist, or team, working his way up and down roads is difficult to prove at any of these periods, probably because it is inaccurate.

Over the last thirty years Spanish and Portuguese scholars have produced a multitude of specialist regional studies, and I am indebted to many of them. The material and the scholarship is often highly valuable but all too often it remains circumscribed by modern regional divisions on maps that have no relation to territories held in ancient or medieval periods. Few attempts have been made to bring together the findings of these regional studies or to see what effect they have on the overall picture. Moreover, most of them are not available in English and thus have not penetrated the wider Anglophone literature on early medieval art. The amount of material available continues to increase and the scholarly disagreements within the literature remain exceptionally impassioned. Whilst attempting to be even-handed and inclusive in referencing, this book has had to be selective and to take a view, which is inevitably contentious. Above all I hope that it opens up questions to a wider group of scholars and initiates more opportunities for dialogue.

This study also works across media, with more attention, by and large, paid to architecture and sculpture, but without ignoring mosaics, metalwork, ivories, or textiles. Some wall paintings are included, but discussion of manuscript illumination is generally omitted because it is such a large subject. Nonetheless, the rhythms of manuscript production and exchange are important, partly because they provide dated benchmarks. In order to

integrate material in different media from such a broad chronological range, I have had to work across disciplines and period specializations. The descriptive languages employed in each specialist area have varied, and I have endeavoured to make these intelligible to each other and for non-specialists, whilst continuing to address key research questions.[10] The results are intended to provide a framework for those not previously familiar with this material, as well as offering some new interpretations of this art and architecture to those who know it well. The images included here are those that are key to the visual argument. Others can be found in major exhibition catalogues from the Metropolitan Museum of Art (New York), *The Art of Medieval Spain A.D. 500-1200* and *al-Andalus: The Art of Islamic Spain.*[11] I hope to make additional images available on my website: www.rosewalker.co.uk. Likewise, the cited publications are not intended to be exhaustive but to highlight more recent work and to support further research.

The first chapter sets out the infrastructure of the Roman roads and focuses on two aspects. The first is the well-known correlation between those roads and the geography of the peninsula, the mountain ranges, rivers, and coasts that shaped the ways of communication. The second highlights the relationship between the roads and the geology of the peninsula, the building stone that was necessary for the development of monumental settlements and the minerals that sometimes generated considerable wealth. In the long period from 200 BC to AD 300 the peninsula was oriented towards Rome, economically and culturally, while metals and other resources were steadily extracted

9   Bonnassie, 1991, 1-59; Rio, 2006, 7-12.

10   For neglect of al-Andalus by modern medievalists and gulfs between disciplines, see Beech, 2008, 311-24.
11   *AAAIS*, 1992; *AMS*, 1993.

and exported. The most established route throughout this period was the *Via Herculea,* renamed the *Via Augusta,* which ran parallel to the east coast until it eventually turned inland to meet the river Guadalquivir. This road served Tarragona, the provincial capital, and crossed the major inland route along the river Ebro. A second north-south artery, now known as the *Via de la Plata,* linked the southern coast and the Guadalquivir to the northern Atlantic seaboard. Further routes gave access to mines, crucially those of the northwest, or followed the Tagus (Tajo in Spanish, Tejo in Portuguese) and Duero (Douro) rivers, so that by the end of the second century AD a visible infrastructure had been constructed across the peninsula, an articulation that endured throughout the period covered by this study and beyond. This chapter gives due weight to the buildings and sculpture of the provincial capitals, Tarragona, Mérida, and Córdoba, which emulated public spaces in Rome and had a potent legacy, but also considers a range of places and structures, whose form, masonry, or decoration survived into later centuries. Materials, workmanship, and building typologies could all be local or imported, although luxury objects tended to belong to the latter category. Whilst the survey of material is careful to acknowledge regional differences that might contribute to debates about 'Romanization', it is ultimately concerned with the shared languages of the Roman Empire.[12] Many excavations have been undertaken and published over the last thirty years. Earlier interventions on sites often remained unrecorded, which means that large numbers of objects in museums lack a secure provenance. Simon Keay has provided a comprehensive summary of work between 1990

and 2003, so this chapter will draw attention to some of the work published since then.[13]

The second chapter examines the high art of the villa estates and the development of a Christian topography. Over the last two decades archaeologists and historians have provided a much more detailed context for the towns and villas of late antique Spain and Portugal.[14] Some of this has been in response to what was seen as too formalist and art historical an approach to the study of the art and architecture and in particular to the treatment of high quality mosaics in isolation from their buildings and sites. This chapter aims to encapsulate much of this new contextual material as well as treating the mosaics as works of art. For this it employs methodologies that have proved successful in other studies of late antique art, including a consideration of the role of *paideia* and of early Christian texts. The elites of the peninsula formed a range of social networks that deployed wealth in order to enhance their status. The same or related aristocratic elites held estates in North Africa, as well as in Italy or Gaul. They shared essentially the same values and aspirations, the same late antique taste, and competed with one another to display their knowledge and preservation of the classical past. At the beginning of the fourth century the western side of the peninsula grew in importance, and the administrative centre of Hispania was moved to Mérida. The six provinces that it oversaw included *Mauretania Tingitana* (northern Morocco), thus extending the north-south axis as far as North Africa. Similarities between certain mosaics in the peninsula and others in North Africa are undeniable, although the mechanisms that constituted this connection remain unknown. The possibility of close social and trade links between the peninsula

---

12   Curchin, 2004.

13   Keay, 2003, 146-211.
14   Kulikowski, 2005a, 31-76.

and North Africa has led to heated debates in recent years. This is problematic, because modern Spain has emphasised its membership of Europe and marginalised its post-colonial links to North Africa, even though some of the most sophisticated intellectual and cultural developments of the fourth century took place in North Africa.

Christianity emerged in Hispania as a visible state religion alongside the flourishing pagan culture, and became more defined dogmatically and institutionally towards the end of the fourth century and into the fifth. This led, in turn, to the emergence of a Christian topography in parts of the peninsula. However, the dates, functions, and contexts of early Christian buildings, tombs, and funerary spaces are often contested. To complicate matters further, the same scholars rarely address the Christian monuments and the pagan material, although Kim Bowes and Michael Kulikowski have done much to remove that barrier. Aside from archaeologists, few others who have a command across that notional divide have considered the Spanish material to any great extent, perhaps because so much of it is fragmentary or lost. It is still not fully integrated into art historical debates around late antiquity. The end of chapter two considers the sparse material culture that may belong to the mid-to-late fifth century. This is a period of absence: after the end of Hydatius's chronicle in 468, there is silence, and, although archaeologists may argue about the effect of the fall of Rome on communities, the production of art and architecture in the peninsula almost ceases. Works that have been dated to this period combine significant changes in form with continuity of subject matter.

The third chapter tackles the Visigothic period. The uncertainties of the two hundred years between AD 300 and 500 are dwarfed by those of the next two hundred, as during the sixth century the peninsula became increasingly fragmented. The arrival of immigrants and other travellers from the east and from North Africa further differentiated cultural connections. Centres like Mérida were able to perpetuate a version of the late late-antique lifestyle, whilst other regions became increasingly impoverished. Trade and church building was able to take place in some circumstances but by the seventh century most of this had halted. In the popular imagination, and indeed often in the scholarly one too, the Visigoths occupy an iconic place.[15] They are the great builders amongst the barbarian kingdoms, the exception to the modest architectural achievements of the Merovingians and the Lombards. Some scholars have modified this picture by arguing that these imposing structures must be the work of indigenous Hispano-Romans facilitated by the peace maintained by the ruling Visigoths. Others, notably Luis Caballero and María de los Ángeles Utrero, have reassigned the main structure of many of these buildings to the ninth or tenth centuries on the basis of archaeology and stratigraphy.[16] Their analyses remain a rich source of information, even if the interpretation has provoked strong reactions. Building archaeology has a longer tradition in the UK, where it works more harmoniously with typological and stylistic approaches.[17] This chapter will go even further and cast doubt on the existence of significant building in the peninsula during the seventh century. Challenges to the exceptional architectural achievements of the Visigoths have not had a smooth path, as the material is physically and conceptually difficult. The idea of a Visigothic kingdom capable of executing monumental

15   Dodds, 1990, 7-26.
16   Caballero, 2000; Utrero, 2010, 1-33.
17   See, for example, Harris, 1975, 109-21.

architecture that preceded and rivalled the Carolingians, the Byzantines, and the Arabs has been immensely seductive. It has been built into the mythology of the lost Christian Visigothic kingdom and thus of the *reconquista.* In Spain, Franco joined earlier rulers who had used that supposedly glorious past to enhance their own reigns. In Portugal, Salazar promoted the medieval era as a golden period of castle, church, and monastery. When national treasures were exchanged between the governments of Pétain's Vichy France and Francoist Spain, Visigothic votive crowns found outside Toledo, but kept in Paris, were high on the list. The crown of King Recceswinth from that hoard will help to provide a methodology for this chapter, which will present the fragmentation and accretion of Visigothic period culture, and its late late-antique taste.

In chapter four the architectural and artistic achievements of the Asturian kings of the ninth century are discussed in the context of both the Carolingian renewal north of the Pyrenees and the building projects of the Umayyad emirs in al-Andalus. All these rulers were interested in the re-invention of the classical past and the reclamation of its technical skill, albeit for different purposes. The monuments of Asturias have been recruited as products of a nascent national story and as signifiers of reconquest, which has distorted their historiography and occasioned later interventions in buildings and objects. This chapter accepts the precept of Caballero and Utrero: that it would not have been possible to revive Roman and late antique techniques of building simply by a process of 'look and learn'. Instead the question is: how was the expertise acquired? Several features suggest that artisans came from al-Andalus, and that once they were in the north they not only contributed their prior knowledge but also engaged with local materials and with the decorative programmes of local surviving

Roman buildings. The interaction between them and their new environment could be immensely creative. It is difficult to identify the circumstances of their arrival, or perhaps more accurately, their sporadic presence, but it indicates more regular and active exchange between communities and individuals in the north and south of the peninsula at this period than is often assumed. One significant circumstance concerns King Ramiro I, who defeated the Vikings in 844 and captured their treasure. This successful defence was perhaps as important as any military action against the Muslims and represented a sudden injection of wealth that either included expertise or enabled its purchase. His contemporary, Muhammad, son of the Rustumid imam in North Africa and in the service of the Cordoban emir, may have helped to repel the Norsemen from al-Andalus, so it is possible that the two men had significant diplomatic contact. By the end of this century, when there was discord in al-Andalus, it looked as if the Asturian kingdom was not only holding its own against the Arabs but also beginning to gain territory. Side by side with this newfound Asturian confidence went a renewed interest in history and especially in the Goths. Chronicle writing flourished and provided the first substantial surviving historical accounts since the Arab invasion of 711. The relationship between these texts and the architectural record is problematic, and I am indebted to Roger Collins for his earlier clarification of this material.[18] In accordance with that I propose a late ninth-century context for churches often placed in the reign of Alfonso II, one that harmonizes with the genre of the chronicles although not with their literary assertions. Archaeologically there is clear evidence of communication between Asturias and al-Andalus, as architectural and

18   Collins, 1989, 1-18.

decorative elements familiar from buildings in Córdoba appeared in churches in the north, showing that there was contact between the courts of Asturias and al-Andalus, even if we cannot be sure of the mechanisms of exchange. Diplomatic gifts and trade in goods and people are the most likely means, alongside voluntary migration, but booty, including captive artisans or ransom payments, is also possible. In this period groups of craftsmen with Andalusi expertise can be found working in the north. The military advantage was not to last but the appropriation of building and decorative techniques from al-Andalus, combined with interest in the Goths, was to have a long and inventive after-life.

One consequence of locating the Asturian churches in the reign of Alfonso III is the questions that it raises regarding other churches assigned to the ninth century. Chapter five maintains that the art and architecture of tenth-century Spain and Portugal was the period of greatest achievement. That description clearly holds for the Great Mosque of Córdoba and for the city of Madīnat-al-Zahrā in the south, and I wish to maintain that it holds also for the so-called 'Mozarabic' art of the north. Thus this chapter examines 'Mozarabic' architecture in the context of the caliphal architecture of Córdoba. In particular it considers the relationship of 'Mozarabic' art to the transformation of the Great Mosque and of the city-palace at Madīnat al-Zahrā in the middle of the tenth century. Throughout the period *c.* 930 to *c.* 1000 the Arabs were in the ascendancy militarily, economically, and culturally. The northern kingdoms, essentially tributary satellite states, benefited from the artistic vibrancy of Córdoba and from its contacts with Byzantium. The Andalusi buildings had a rhythm of development, which I suggest applied similarly to those in the north. For example, both the Great Mosque of Córdoba and Madīnat

al-Zahrā were brought to their culmination in the reign of al-Hakam II (r. 961-976). I argue that some of the 'Mozarabic' churches may be better dated to coincide with those apogees of artistic achievement in the later tenth century. At the same time, in the north, the production of illuminated manuscripts was experiencing a period of exceptional maturity. This chapter will end by discussing a small group of figurative sculptures, some from the north often labelled 'Visigothic', and a piece from the south linked stylistically to dated manuscripts. It will consider whether these exceptional bodies and faces come from different periods or if they represent a new interest in the human figure at the end of the tenth century.

The first half of the eleventh century saw change on a massive scale in the peninsula. Between 1008 and 1031 the Caliphate of Córdoba imploded.[19] Chapter six weighs up the artistic implications of this major event for the northern Christian kingdoms. What eventually emerged was a number of independent kingdoms, or taifas, of varying size and with diverse local allegiances and traditions.[20] The map of this period resembles a patchwork quilt, and this greater equivalence in territory, as opposed to the vast size of the old Caliphate, reflects the *realpolitik* of the time. Each kingdom had to vie for position regardless of religious affiliation. Catalonia and Castile had intervened as mercenaries on different sides of the conflict in Córdoba, and the resulting payment and booty that they took home boosted their economies and the position of their rulers. It may be no coincidence that this preceded a major period of architectural and artistic patronage in Catalonia and, to a lesser extent, in Castile. Almost nothing is known about what happened to the

19 Scales, 1994.
20 Wasserstein, 1985.

hundreds of craftsmen who had been trained and had worked in Córdoba. Several doubtless found a place in one of the taifa kingdoms. It is not inconceivable that others were employed – or owned – by Christian rulers. Catalonia and the influence of Bishop Oliba are often studied separately from the rest of the peninsula. This chapter, however, will consider the Catalonian works alongside the political events and artistic production of León, Castile, Navarre, and Aragón.

Both Gómez-Moreno and George Gaillard saw elements of 'Mozarabic' art in early Romanesque and shared an enthusiasm for Córdoba.[21] Yet neither paid sufficient attention to the taifa kingdoms that were direct neighbours of Christian rulers. Instead Gómez-Moreno dismissed the art of the taifa kingdoms as degenerate, superficial, and derivative. In his opinion the fragmentation of the Caliphate was a disaster. More recently scholars have demonstrated that this was not a period of decline but one in which centres of sophisticated courtly art and literature flourished in architectural settings that continued to develop the repertoire of Córdoba.[22] From the mid-eleventh century the sons of Sancho III of Navarre and the Count of Barcelona began to extract tributary payments, *parias,* from the taifa kingdoms. Chapter seven will examine how this new flow of wealth from south to north and across the east-west axis of the peninsula had an immediate and spectacular effect on luxury arts, especially at the Navarrese and Leonese courts. Accomplished buildings continued to be completed in Catalonia but only to a limited extent in the west of the peninsula, where relatively modest structures remained stage sets for the glittering new liturgical furniture. Highly innovative

metalwork and ivory carving took place at San Millán de la Cogolla (Navarre), where goldsmiths from the German Empire worked with ivory carvers, who probably had Andalusi training, to produce a large new shrine for St. Aemilian. The surviving ivory panels and the lost metalwork set out the full narrative of the saint's life as well as depicting the royal patrons, the rulers and scholars of the monastery, and the craftsmen who made the shrine. This kind of collaboration may be paradigmatic, and has far-reaching implications for art and architecture in the peninsula and beyond.

The eighth chapter considers the emergence of Romanesque art and architecture. Traditional methodologies have concentrated on the role of the pilgrimage roads and been caught up in the arguments about the precedence of Toulouse or Santiago de Compostela. This chapter explicitly avoids that approach and instead considers some of this highly complex material through an idea used by historians of this period, the friendship circle of Pope Gregory VII.[23] This nexus of social interaction overlaid the old network of roads. The richer documentary sources for this period make it possible to glimpse the agency of individuals, and perhaps even their personal lives, in the contemporary architecture and art. Sometimes this involved the royal families of León and Aragón, at other times bishops and papal legates were the important figures. It was those same papal legates who may have promoted the use of Roman or late antique exemplars, above all sarcophagi, as sources of artistic inspiration from Braga to Toulouse. In this choice they disregarded the intervening centuries of artistic development in the peninsula, picking up threads that were buried deep in the tapestry of Iberian artistic production.

21 Gaillard, 1938a; Gómez-Moreno, 1919; Gómez-Moreno, 1934.
22 Robinson, 2002.

23 Rennie, 2008, 475-496.

In 1085 Alfonso VI of León and Castile took possession of Toledo, the capital, and of much of the territory of the taifa kingdom. The Berber rulers of Toledo, close allies and perhaps even friends of Alfonso, had been generous patrons of the arts, who acquired ivory carvers. Although this event was not as significant as the fall of Córdoba – or the much later sack of Constantinople in 1204 – nonetheless this conquest had the potential to provide an immediate supply of new artists and materials in the kingdom of León. In this way, artistic expertise fostered by al-Andalus may have entered the northern kingdoms in the person of slaves and freedmen. They brought with them the classical artistic vocabulary that had evolved under the Umayyads and their successors. I propose that they went on to circulate amongst the royal and papal networks of the peninsula and beyond as part of a complex network of obligations. The taking of Toledo had other repercussions, as the other taifa kingdoms responded by appealing to the Almoravid Berbers of North Africa for help, and Alfonso VI was increasingly unable to extract *paria* payments. This had not been a world of sentimental *convivencia,* but one of delicately balanced power relationships that were constantly negotiated, what Brian Catlos has called utility or *'conveniencia'*.[24] During the twelfth century the successes of the Berber Almoravid army and the militaristic Christianity of the papacy combined to destroy that equilibrium and to create a different world, one that lies outside the scope of this book.[25]

24 Catlos, 2004, 407; Soifer, 2009, 24.
25 Brett, 1997, 105-13; O'Callaghan, 2003, 23-98.