INSTEAD OF A PREFACE: MISCELLANEA ON BELONGING, DETACHMENT AND THE REPRESENTATION OF MUSICAL IDENTITIES IN VISUAL CULTURE

ANTONIO BALDASSARRE AND ARABELLA TENISWOOD-HARVEY

I heard it said of somebody that he is leading a double life. I think to myself: Just two?[1]

It is no wonder that so much of the search for identity among American Negroes was championed by Jazz musicians. Long before the modern essayists and scholars wrote of racial identity as a problem for a multiracial world, musicians were returning to their roots to affirm that which was stirring within their souls.[2]

The present edited and peer-reviewed collection of essays has emerged from scholarly meetings organised by Association Répertoire International d'Iconographie Musicale (RIdIM) over the last decade. The collection's topical focus, i.e. the concepts of belonging, detachment and identity, is of recurring interest and relevance to scholars working in the field of music in visual culture.[3]

---

1   Leon Wieseltier, "Against Identity: An Idea Whose Time Has Gone," *New Republic*, November 28, 1994, 24–32, here 30.

2   Martin Luther King Jr., *Opening Address to the 1964 Berlin Jazz Festival*, quoted after Walton M. Muyumba, *The Shadow and the Act: Black Intellectual Practice, Jazz Improvisation, and Philosophical Pragmatism* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2009), 153.

3   For the sake of brevity at least the following contributions from a large number of quite different methodological and topical perspectives should be mentioned: Richard Leppert, *The Sight of Sound: Music, Representation, and the History of the Body* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1993); Marcia Pointon, *Strategies for Showing: Women, Possession, and Representation in English Visual Culture, 1665 – 1800* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), particularly 229–305; Sheila Whiteley, Andy Bennett, and Stan Hawkins, eds., *Music, Space and Place: Popular Music and Cultural Identity* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004); Danette Ifert Johnson, "Music Videos and National Identity in Post-Soviet Kazakhstan," *Qualitative Research Reports in Communication* 7, no. 1 (2006): 9–14, doi: 10.1080/17459430600964513; Stan Hawkins and Sarah Niblock, *Prince: The Making of a Pop Music Phenomenon* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011); Lauren Gorfinkel, *Performing the Chinese Nation: The Politics of Identity in China Central Television's Music-Entertainment Programs* (PhD thesis, University of Technology Sydney, 2011); Lizelle Bisschoff and Stefanie Van de Peer, eds., *Art and Trauma in Africa: Representations of Reconciliation in Music, Visual Arts, Literature and Film* (London: I.B. Tauris, 2013); Antonio Baldassarre, "Being Engaged Not Informed: French "Orientalists" Revisited," *Music in Art* 38, no. 1–2 (2013): 63–87; Arabella Teniswood-Harvey, "Music and Cross-Cultural Exchange in the Art of Tom Roberts, Arthur Streeton and James McNeill Whistler", *Music in Art* 38, no. 1–2 (2013): 89–99; Tim Shephard and Anne Leonard, eds., *The Routledge Companion to Music and Visual Culture*

The collection's title interlaces three concepts that continue to be of extremely high significance given the current and escalating global crises. War, despotism, racism, anti-Semitism, climate change, and pandemic emergency are among the most influential factors that shape the concepts of belonging, detachment and identity nowadays. The essays in this volume prove that these concepts are not new but are often apparent, regardless of cultural and temporal contexts.

Belonging and detachment refer to social positions and practices that further specify the framing of what is generally labelled with the term "identity." These ideas affect concepts of "identity" as much as they express forms of "identity." However, the concept of identity is anything but clearly defined and specified even though the term "identity" is heard "over and over again" and distinguished as a "key word,"[4] as Robert Penn Warren cogitated as early as 1965; and it means something quite different depending on the disciplinary perspective or the method applied in a research venture. This is, on the one hand, already evident in the ambiguous nature of the concept of identity, uniting individual as much as collective dimensions and phenomena.[5] As early as the 1950s Erik H. Erikson, the internationally acknowledged developmental psychoanalyst, described or identified "identity"

(New York and London: Routledge, 2014); Tim Shephard, *Echoing Helicon: Music, Art and Identity in the Este Studioli, 1440–1530* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014); Michelle M. Tomlinson, "A Case Study of Diverse Multimodal Influences on Music Improvisation Using Visual Methodology", *International Journal of Music Education*, 34, no. 3 (2016): 271–284; Michael Webb and Camellia Webb-Gannon, "Musical Melanesianism: Imagining and Expressing Regional Identity and Solidarity in Popular Song and Video," *The Contemporary Pacific* 28, no. 1 (2016): 59–95; Arabella Teniswood-Harvey, "Reconsidering the ANZAC Legend: Music, National Identity and the Australian Experience of World War I, as Portrayed in the Australian War Memorial's Art and Photographic Collections," *Music in Art*, 41, no 1–2 (2016): 11–22; Antonio Baldassarre, "Envisioned History or "His Story": Warfare, Musical Culture and Imagination in the Lucerne Chronicle (1509–1513) by Diebold Schilling the Younger," *Music in Art* 41, no. 1–2 (2016): 9–63; Alexander J. Fisher, *Music and Religious Identity in Counter-Reformation Augsburg, 1580–1630* (London: Routledge, 2017); Joshua S. Walden, *Musical Portraits: The Composition of Identity in Contemporary and Experimental Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2018); Antonio Baldassarre, "Identity, Ritual and Materiality of Bourgeois Power Performance: Oskar Reinhart's "Club zur Geduld" in Winterthur," in *Music Cultures in Sounds, Words and Images. Essays in Honor of Zdravko Blažeković*, eds. Antonio Baldassarre and Tatjana Marković (Vienna: Hollitzer Verlag, 2018), 313–340; Cynthia J. Becker, *Blackness in Morocco: Gnawa Identity through Music and Visual Culture* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2020); Ayse Guler, "The Transformative Role of Music in Visual Arts Education: Rediscovering Intercultural and Interdisciplinary Possibilities through A/r/tographic Inquiry," *Journal of Qualitative Research in Education* 28 (2021): 204–240, doi: 10.14689/enad.28.9; Antonio Cascelli and Denis Condon, eds., *Experiencing Music and Visual Cultures: Threshold, Intermediality*, *Synchresis* (London and New York: Routledge, 2021); Jörg Fingerhut, Javier Gomez Lavin, Claudia Winkelmayr, and Jesse J. Prinz, "The Aesthetic Self. The Importance of Aesthetic Taste in Music and Art for Our Perceived Identity", *Frontiers in Psychology* 11 (2021), doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2020.577703.

4   Robert Penn Warren, *Who Speaks for the Negro* (New York: Random House, 1965), 17.

5   See in this respect the seminal study by Kwame Anthony Appiah, *The Lies that Bind: Rethinking Identity* (New York: Liveright, 2018).

in his writing as being "vague," "ambiguous," "naive," "unfathomable," and so on.[6] Some decades later, Leon Wieseltier concurs in such a judgement with his critical and impassioned remarks, arguing that "identity" (the singular form is essential) is "an illusion," while "a greater truth" lies in "the plural," i.e. "identities," thus acknowledging the complexity and diversity of both the term and the concept: "In the modern world, the cruelest thing that you can do to people is to make them ashamed of their complexity."[7] And more recently Kenan Malik has published a critical and confrontational examination of the politics of identity, elucidating and impugning the concept's intricate history and its alterations throughout.[8]

On the other hand, it comes therefore with no surprise that "identity" has been subject to growing and pervasive (sometimes even flamboyant) criticism since the 1970s, largely stimulated by the term's "over-use"[9] that induced Robert Coles to express the deprecatory assessment of the concept as "the purest of clichés."[10] This criticism in no way hindered the profound and scholarly examination of the concept of identity and its manyfold dimensions – a difficult endeavour which not only has to prove itself to criticism but also has to unambiguously differentiate itself from the enormous glut of popular-scientific contributions on identity (including the so-called self-help literature) that has been flooding the market for three decades.[11]

From the 1980s onwards, weighty scholarly research on topics of race, class, religion, and gender as related to identity added additional facets to the already relatively open concept of identity, thus contributing to further dissolution and fragmentation of the concept.[12] The boundless abundance of research literature on identity appears to be almost contradictory to the understanding of what constitutes the essence of identity. Consequently, what Augustine expressed about "the time" applies, by analogy, to identity: "si nemo ex me quaerat, scio; si quaerenti explicare velim, nescio," i.e., "if one asks me, I know what it is. If I wish to explain it to him who asks, I do not know."[13]

---

6   See for instance Erik Erikson, *Childhood and Society* (New York: Norton, 1950), *Young Man Luther: A Study in Psychoanalysis and History* (New York: Norton, 1958), *Identity and the Life Cycle: Selected Papers* (New York: International University Press, 1959), *Identity, Youth, and Crisis* (New York: Norton, 1968).

7   Wieseltier, "Against Identity,", 30.

8   Kenan Malik, *Not So Black and White: A History of Race from White Supremacy to Identity Politics* (La Vergne: Hurst Publishers, 2023).

9   See William James Millar Mackenzie, *Political Identity* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1978), 11.

10   Robert Coles, review of "Dimensions of a New Identity by Erik H. Erikson," *New Republic*, June 8, 1974, 23.

11   A remarkable example in this context is the popular-science philosophical bestseller *Wer bin ich – und wenn ja, wie viele?* by Richard David Precht published with Goldmann Verlag in 2007 (in English released as *Who am I? And If so, How Many?*, New York: Random House, 2011) that still enjoys considerable international prestige.

12   Appiah, *The Lies that Bind*, provides an exhaustive and well-founded overview of this research output.

13   Augustinus, *Confessiones*, liber XI, caput XIV.

One of the fundamental challenges in the discourses on "identity" consists, as Rogers Brubaker and Frederick Cooper have pointed out, in the fact that identity "is both a category of practice and a category of analysis".[14] Also, it is substantially indistinct to such an extent that it is "hopelessly ambiguous for an analytical concept."[15] On this ground the authors argue that – from a conceptual point of view – "identity" is not an essential analytical concept and that "alternative analytical idioms" exist "that can do the necessary work without the attendant confusion."[16]

The multivalent burden of the identity concept has a special place within the arts. The stories of Edgar Allen Poe and Ernst Theodor Amadeus Hoffmann implemented this subject with particular virtuosity, as do films by David Lynch today. Virginia Woolf's novel *Orlando: A Biography* (1928) and the enthralling US neo-noir thriller film *Identity* (2003) are impressive examples of the productive force that the concept of identity can be. While Woolf's novel thematizes shifting gender identity, James Mangold's film *Identity* is determined by a cleverly constructed plot involving the alleged serial killer Malcolm Rivers who suffers from dissociative identity disorder, and his son Timothy, the real homicidal serial killer, who has taken control of his father – combining a reverse chronology structure in the main plot with a chronological, forward-moving subplot. And most recently, two literary works and one musical opus – to mention at least three instances from a vast corpus of examples – have caused a tremendous stir with the pitiless examination of an "identity odyssey". On the one hand, the 2021 novel *Changer: méthode* by the French author Édouard Louis who has enjoyed unbroken extensive attention since his first novel *En finir avec Eddy Bellegueule* (which was also strongly shaped by identity subject matters),[17] not only recounts the intimate yet highly politically charged story of a young man who has already lived several lives but also provides a kind of "manual" of self-reinvention and self-fashioning.[18] The novel includes not only explicit allusions to the persona of Didier Eribon, the French sociologist,[19] but also a literary treatment of what Pierre Bourdieu has characterised as the features defining an individual's place in the social strata, i.e. the economic, social and cultural capitals. On the other hand, the debut novel by the Swiss writer Kim de l'Horizon entitled *Blutbuch* and awarded with both the German and Swiss Book Prizes 2022, deals with a highly pressing identity topic that is driving the current gender identity discourse:

---

14 Rogers Brubaker and Frederick Cooper, "Beyond 'Identity'," *Theory and Society* 29, no. 1 (2000): 1–47, here 4.

15 Ibid, 6.

16 Ibid, 9.

17 Édourd Louis, *En finir avec Eddy Bellegueule* (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 2014); English translation *The End of Eddy*, trans. Michael Lucey (London: Harvill Secker, 2017). Meanwhile this has been translated into more than 20 languages.

18 Édourd Louis, *Changer: méthode* (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 2021).

19 It is well known that the questions linked to identity play a significant role in Eribon's writings. See for instance Didier Eribon, *Retour à Reims* (Paris: Fayard, 2009), English as *Returning to Reims*, intro. George Chauncey, trans. Michael Lucey (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 2018), and Didier Eribon, *La société comme verdict. Classes, identités, trajectoires* (Paris: Fayard, 2013).

the first-person narrator identifies themself neither as male nor female and explores, unsparingly and without complacency, the past times that were dominated by the dichotomy between the feminine and masculine, a dichotomy to which everything seemed to be subjected.[20] Finally, the opera *Cloudstreet* by George Palmer, based on one if not the most popular and adored Australian homonymous novel by Tim Winton[21] and premiered at the State Opera of South Australia on 14 May 2016. The foreground of this two-act opera forms the account of two working-class families over a span of about twenty years and their domestic life and exposure to a changing world filled with tragedy, love, and forgiveness. The family saga ultimately widens into a striking portrait of a period of significant transformation in Australia's national identity, the 1940s to the early 1960s, strikingly illustrated not only by the references to influential world-historical key events (such as World War II and the Korean War as well as John F. Kennedy's homicide) but also the examination of momentous identity-shaping Australian cultural myths. These include the "Aussie battler" and the idealisation of Australia's rural and suburban lifestyles alluding to the concept of Australia as the "lucky country" – both a kind of utopian idyll and "post war disillusion"[22] that is sharply juxtaposed by the novel's most prominent historical character, the Nedlands Monster, the nickname of the serial killer Eric Edgar Cooke. According to the Australian Dictionary of Biography, "the social impact of Cooke's crimes and the atmosphere in which he was tried are imaginatively but faithfully reflected in Tim Winton's novel."[23]

An additional difficulty of the intellectually appropriate application of the concept of identity in a persuasive and epistemologically useful manner, consists, as Odo Marquard has argued in an essay of 1979 in the fact that:

> The subject of 'identity' has identity difficulties: the current inflationary development of its discussion brings not only findings, but also confusion. To an increasing extent, the following applies precisely to identity: everything flows. Thus, the contours of the identity problem become blurred; it develops into a trouble cloud with fogging effect: identity discussions turn out to be – with increasing risk of collision – a blind flight.[24]

---

20 Kim de l'Horizon, *Blutbuch* (Cologne: DuMont, 2022).

21 Tim Winton, *Cloudstreet* (Ringwood, Victoria: McPhee Gribble, 1991).

22 Michael Halliwell, *National Identity in Contemporary Australian Opera: Myths Reconsidered* (London: Routledge, 2018).

23 Hugh Collins, "Cooke, Eric Edgar," *Australian Dictionary of Biography*, accessed January 1, 2023, https://adb.anu.edu.au/biography/cooke-eric-edgar-9817.

24 "Das Thema 'Identität' hat Identitätsschwierigkeiten: die gegenwärtig inflationäre Entwicklung seiner Diskussion bringt nicht nur Ergebnisse, sondern auch Verwirrungen. In wachsendem Maße gilt gerade bei der Identität: alles fließt. So werden die Konturen des Identitätsproblems unscharf; es entwickelt sich zur Problemwolke mit Nebelwirkung: Identitätsdiskussionen werden – mit erhöhtem Kollisionsrisiko – zum Blindflug." Odo Marquard, "Identität: Schwundtelos und Mini-Essenz. Bemerkungen zur Genealogie einer aktuellen Diskussion", in: *Identität* (Munich: Fink, 1979), 347–369, here 347. All translations in this introduction are by the authors, unless otherwise stated.

Similarly, Akeel Bilgrami has outlined that

> It is doubtful that the concept of identity is susceptible to a substantial philosophical treatment at a high level of generality. This is so not so much because there are too many disparate theories of identity, but more because the sorts of things, the question of whose identity are taken up by philosophers, are too disparate to get a uniform treatment. Broadly speaking, two conspicuously different sets of interests make such a treatment especially difficult. The concept of 'identity' when applied to such very basic categories as objects, properties (or universals), events, and persons, forms a cluster of themes in metaphysics and these receive a kind of analysis far removed from such themes as national, ethnic, racial or sexual identity, which are usually discussed in political philosophy and moral psychology. No obviously common notion of identity, which is either tractable or interesting, spans both sets of interests.[25]

Stuart Hall's introduction to the volume *Questions of Cultural Identity* (edited by Hall and Paul du Gay)[26] proves to be ground-breaking in theoretical and methodological terms, unfolding and reflecting upon different positions. These range from Jacques Derrida's view of identity as being "constructed through, not outside, difference,"[27] understood as a bipolar composition that is grounded in the debarment of something and the establishment of a powerful hierarchy between the two resulting poles,[28] to the positions developed by Louis Althusser, Jacques Lacan, Michel Foucault and Judith Butler. A brief summary and examination of Hall's considerations not only provide an outline of the major tendencies of the discussion on identity and bring some systematic order to this discussion,[29] but also illuminate the unavoidable consequences one faces when exploring "identity."

For Althusser the so-called "ideological state apparatuses," i.e., state-building institutions such as the government, school, family etc., primarily constitute those agencies that shape the subject by processes of enslavement and subjection. These agencies represent ideologies to which the individual as subject is subjugated or voluntarily submits.[30] It was the ideological dimension that linked Althusser's theory with the discourses of identity formation in psychology and psychoanalysis, given

---

25 Akeel Bilgrami, "Identity," *Political Concepts,* issue 1 (2012), accessed February 1, 2022, https://www.politicalconcepts.org/category/issue-1.

26 Stuart Hall, "Introduction: Who Needs 'Identity'?," in *Questions of Cultural Identity*, eds. Stuart Hall and Paul du Gay (London: Sage, 1996), 1–18.

27 Ibid, 4.

28 See Jacques Derrida, *Positions* (Paris: Les Éditions de Minuit, 1972), English translation: *Positions*, trans. Alan Bass (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981).

29 For this purpose, see also the chapter "Identitätstheorien" in Ulrike Pörnbacher, *Ambivalenzen der Moderne – Chancen und Risiken der Identitätsarbeit von Jugendlichen* (Opladen: Leske + Budrich, 1999), 13–29.

30 See Louis Althusser, "Idéologie et appareils idéologiques d'Etat. Notes pour une recherche," *La Pensée* 151 (1970): 3–38, English translation: *On the Reproduction of Capitalism: Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses,* trans. and ed. Geoffrey M. Goshgarian (London: Verso, 2014).

that ideology is powerful precisely "because it works at the most rudimentary levels of psychic identity and the drives."[31] In this context, Hall rightly added that ideology is effective only

> because it works at *both* 'the rudimentary levels of psychic identity and the drives' *and* at the level of the discursive formation and practices which constitute the social field; and that it is in the articulation of these mutually constitutive but not identical fields that the real conceptual problem lies. The term identity – which arises precisely at the point of intersection between them – is thus the site of difficulty.[32]

Lacan approached the problem of identity through the human ability of self-awareness:

> […] the human child, at an age when he is for a short while, but for a while nevertheless, outdone by the chimpanzee in instrumental intelligence, can already recognize his own image as such in a mirror. This recognition is identical by the illuminative mimicry of the *Aha-Erlebnis*, which Köhler considers situational appreciation, an essential moment in the act of intelligence. Indeed, this act, far from exhausting itself, as in the case of a monkey, in eventually acquired control over the uselessness of the image, immediately gives rise in a child to a series of gestures in which he playfully experiences the relationship between the movements made in the image and the reflected environment, and between this virtual complex and the reality it duplicates – namely, the child's own body, and the persons and even things around him.[33]

In contrast, and in conscious rejection of a subject-based theoretical approach, Michel Foucault assumes that the subject could only be understood as produced within specific discursive formations that are shaped through power relations and resistance practices. Consequently, his main interest focuses on "examining the

---

31   Jacqueline Rose, *Sexuality in the Field of Vision* (London: Verso, 1986), 5.

32   Hall, "Introduction: Who Needs 'Identity'?," 7 (emphasis original).

33   "[…] le petit d'homme à un âge où il est pour un temps court, mais encore un temps, dépassé en intelligence instrumentale par le chimpanzé, reconnaît pourtant déjà l'image dans le miroir comme telle. Reconnaissance signalée par la mimique du *Aha-Erlebnis*, où pour Köhler s'exprime l'aperception situationnelle, temps essentiel de l'acte d'intelligence. Cet acte, en effet, loin de s'épuiser comme chez le singe dans le contrôle une fois acquis de l'inanité de l'image, rebondit aussitôt chez l'enfant en une série de gestes où il éprouve ludiquement la relation des mouvements assumés de l'image à son environnement reflété, et de ce complexe virtuel à la réalité qu'il redouble, soit à son propre corps et aux personnes, voire aux objets qui se tiennent à ses côtés." Jacques Lacan, "Le stade du miroir comme formateur de la fonction du Je, telle qu'elle nous est révélée dans l'expérience psychanalytique," *Revue française de psychanalyse* 13 (1949): 449–455, here 499 (emphasis original), English translation: *Écrits*, trans. Bruce Fink (New York: W. W. Norton, 2006), 93 (emphasis original). The reference to Köhler concerns: Wolfgang Köhler, *L'intelligence des singnes supérieurs*, trans. Paul Guillaume (Paris: Alcan, 1927).

polymorphous techniques of power" in order to "bring out 'will to knowledge' that serves" the discursive productions and effects of power as "their support and their instrument."[34] In this way, Foucault explicitly rejects the idea of the "autonomous subject" and highlights, on the one hand, the historicity of the human being and, on the other hand, its indissoluble encapsulation into discursive social structures and conditions,[35] the so-called fields of discourse, such as religion, economics, science, politics etc. In such fields the human being turns into an "enslaved sovereign, observed spectator."[36]

In Foucault's late work, a theoretical shift takes place insofar as the power of the discursive fields is modified to the extent that the subject is no longer completely powerless. Rather,

> the "centering" of the discursive practice cannot work without the constitution of subject, the theoretical work cannot be fully accomplished without complementing the account of discursive and disciplinary regulation with an account of the practice of subjective self-constitution. It has never been enough – in Marx, in Althusser, in Foucault – to elaborate a theory of how individuals are summoned into place in the discursive structures. It has always, also, required an account of how subjects are constituted.[37]

Against this background Foucault's theory opens up to concepts of performativity to some extent. The tendency of the late Foucault to understand the formation of the subject as a process comparable to an artistic act fit into the shifted perception of the relationship between the discursive fields and the individual as enslaved object and as liberated subject. "What strikes me," the late Foucault comments,

> is the fact that in our society, art has become something which is related to objects and not to individuals, or to life. That art is something which is specialized or which is done by experts who are artists. But couldn't everyone's life become a

---

34 "[…] examiner 'les techniques polymorphes du pouvoir'" afin "de dégager la 'volonté de savoir' qui sert" – concernant les "productions discursives et" effets de pouvoir" – à la fois leurs support et leurs instrument." Michel Foucault, *La volonté du savoir* (= *Histoire de la sexualité*, vol. I) (Paris: Gallimard, 1976), 20, English translation: *The History of Sexuality*, vol. 1, trans. Robert Hurley (New York: Pantheon Books, 1978), 11–12.

35 See "Che cos'è Lei Professore Foucault?" (Intervista con P. Caruso), *La fiera letteraria,* 42/39 (September 28, 1967), 11–15, reprinted in an extended version in *Conversazioni con Claude Lévi–Strauss, Michael Foucault, Jacques Lacan*, ed. Paolo Caruso (Milan: U. Mursia, 1969), 91–131, English translation: "Who are you, Professor Foucault," in *Religion and Culture*, selected and ed. Jeremy R. Carrette (New York: Routledge, 1999), 87–104.

36 "souverain, soumis, spectator regardé". Michel Foucault, *Les mots et les choses: Une archéologie des sciences humaines* (Paris: Gallimard, 1966), 323, English translation: *The Order of Things: An Archeology of Human Science*, trans. Alan Sheridan (London: Tavistock, 1970), 312. See also Michel Foucault, *Naissance de la clinique. Une archéologie du regard médical* (Paris, Presses Universitaires de France, 1963), English translation: *The Birth of the Clinic*, trans. A. M. Sheridan Smith (London: Tavistock Publ., 1973).

37 Hall, "Introduction: Who Needs 'Identity'?," 13.

work of art? Why should the lamp or the house be an art object but not our life? […] From the idea that the self is not given to us, I think that there is only one practical consequence: we have to create ourselves as a work of art.[38]

The idea of a close and intertwined relation between identity and performativity is taken up and further developed by Judith Butler, particularly in her seminal studies *Gender Trouble* (1990) and *Bodies That Matter* (1993).[39] "Identity" is not a fixed or stable concept but rather it is balanced only through the performative acts that attempt, even if precariously, to stabilise identity as intrinsic parts of human existence. Consequently, the idea of a stable identity dissolves or – in the case of conceptual matters – needs to be thought of as performed ritual:

> Performativity cannot be understood outside of a process of iterability, a regularized and constrained repetition of norms. And this repetition is not performed *by* a subject; this repetition is what enables a subject and constitutes the temporal condition for the subject. This iterability implies that 'performance' is not a singular 'act' or event, but a ritualized production, a ritual reiterated under and through constraint, under and through the force of prohibition and taboo, with the threat of ostracism and even death controlling and compelling the shape of the production, but not, I will insist, determining it fully in advance.[40]

Therefore, identities are, despite all external regulations and constraints, not only a topic of ascription (in the sense of external ascription) and exclusion, but always also a question of choice within the performative options in the given matrix.

The contributions in this volume remarkably evidence, that despite all the theoretical and practical challenges faced by any scholarly venture involved with topics of identity, some key uses can be identified which are not distinctly separated from each other but rather show affinities. The concept of "identity" can be applied

> to highlight non-instrumental modes of action to focus on self-understanding rather than self-interest; to designate sameness across persons or sameness over time; to capture allegedly core, foundational aspects of selfhood; to deny that such core, foundational aspects exist; to highlight the processual, interactive development of solidarity and collective self-understanding; and to stress the fragmented quality of the contemporary experience of 'self,' a self unstably patched together through shards of discourse and contingently 'activated' in differing contexts.[41]

---

38 Michel Foucault, "On the Genealogy of Ethics: An Overview of Work in Progress," in *The Foucault Reader*, ed. Paul Rabinow (New York: Pantheon, 1983), 340–372, here 350–351.
39 Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York: Routledge, 1990); Judith Butler, *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of "Sex"* (New York: Routledge, 1993).
40 Judith Butler, *Bodies That Matter*, 95 (emphasis original).
41 Brubaker and Cooper, "Beyond 'Identity,'" *Theory and Society* 29, no. 1 (2000): 1–47, here 8.

The idea of a clearly defined and fixed identity proves to be a phantasmagoria: individuals are always more than one. Consequently, identity needs to be understood multidimensionally and to be conceived as a project, as a creation – in an individual as much as in a collective sense. Identity has no essence, it is ephemeral and constantly changeable by individual choices and by the individual's specific contexts. Individuals imagine, invent, perform, create, and live various identities simultaneously – limited solely by the fact that, as Appiah posits, identities can only act and flower as an inner voice when they are shared with and recognised by others.[42]

Especially in times as ours which are shaped by social and political unrest and drastic changes in the political, economic, and social landscapes, concepts of identity come under increasing pressure, questions of belonging and detachment turn out to again be pressing human concerns, and concerns relating to identity strongly permeate visual culture. In this context, pictures and images can no longer be underrated as illustrations or as residues that have a complementary or corrective function regarding other sources, particularly written source material. The visual is a source of knowledge in its own right and needs to be treated adequately as an epistemological object as W.J.T. Mitchell and Gottfried Boehm, for example, have explained and convincingly justified.[43]

The collected essays in this volume address a plethora of topics linked to the field of the visual representation of identity. These include how people explore the concept of identity via visual means; how visual identity representations may serve as sources to acquire knowledge about topics of concern to society; how visual representation of identity/ies engage in socio-cultural and socio-political discourses; how visual source material may provide insights into individual and collective identity/ies and so forth.

In this context it is noteworthy to emphasise that visual sources are not exclusively the result of an intentional action in the general sense. As products of culturally shaped, individual thinking and action, they cannot be completely explained by purely rationally constructed interests and ideas. In addition, it is rather doubtful that human actions and statements are generally controlled by conscious strategies. In that sense objects of visual culture, as with written or oral sources, must be interpreted "as a gauze of signifiers and significant unities that […] always go beyond the intended meaning."[44] That is why the analysis of the superordinate discursive patterns is essential to an understanding of visual sources as a human expression. This is also the reason why purely stylistic and formalist analysis of visual sources has clear limits. In this respect the philosopher Berel Lang convinc-

---

42 Appiah, *The Lies that Bind*, 217–218.
43 In this respect see the essay of Antonio Baldassarre in this volume.
44 "[…] als ein Gewebe von Signifikanten und signifikativen Einheiten, die […] immer über den einheitlichen, intendierten Sinn hinausgehen." Philipp Sarasin, "Subjekt, Diskurse, Körper: Überlegungen zu einer diskursanalytischen Kulturgeschichte," in *Kulturgeschichte Heute*, ed. Wolfgang Hardtwig and Hans-Ulrich Wehler (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck und Ruprecht, 1996) 131–64, here 156.

ingly argued that style and form analysis is not a science but "a vision of fiction – a narrative form – tied to the literary trope of synecdoche in which one feature is an ingredient in all the others."[45]

State-of-the-art methodological concepts offer new ways of approaching the core paradox that pertains to research into visual culture to the same extent as in literary studies, art studies or musicology. It is the paradox concerning the meta-discourse (or much more appropriately the meta-"viscourse"[46] when dealing with visual source material) of history and reality that visual representations activate, but seemingly as if they were not communicating or negotiating history and reality but only following rules of artistic production or of aesthetic enjoyment. In this respect objects of visual culture enfold narrative strategies embodied in processes of production and reception without being simply reducible to one single narrative. Tzvetan Todorv, for instance, has described the "discovery of America" as the encounter of two very different and contradictory narrative cultures[47] as also evidenced in visual culture when taking into account the studies *La guerre des images* by Serge Gruzinski and *Marvelous Possessions* by Stephen Greenblatt.[48] Accepting this notion requires that the multifold narrative dimensions of a visual source are not always present to the same extent but also that they can change in time.

As we write these lines, all over the world, people are struggling with issues of political, social, religious, gender, race etc. identity, while being part of a community or a network, or being pushed into forced exile, both in the literal and figurative sense. In this respect the present volume deals with anything other than abstract issues or even elitist questions only of specific concern within ivory-tower circles. On the contrary: in addition to the aforementioned struggles, consider the recently launched, artificial-intelligence powered website *This Person Does Not Exist*,[49] designed to call attention to the ever-increasing power of artificial intelligence to represent itself as real. It puts forward images that are completely artificial and seeks to make visible the precarious and increasingly ephemeral status or nature of human identity by presenting us with images of people that have never "existed" (in the common, everyday understanding of "existence") but are created

---

45   Berel Lang, "Looking for the Styleme," in *The Concept of Style*, ed. Berel Lang (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1987, rev. ed.), 182.

46   The term "viscourse" refers to a concept as introduced by Karin Knorr-Cetina to point out the embedment of visual representations in an ongoing communicative exchange. See Karin Knorr Cetina, "'Viskurse' der Physik: Konsensbildung und visuelle Darstellung," in *Mit dem Auge denken. Strategien der Sichtbarmachung in wissenschaftlichen und virtuellen Welten*, ed. Bettina Heintz and Jörg Huber (Vienna: Springer, 2001), 305–320.

47   Tzvetan Todorov, *La conquête de l'Amérique. La question de l'autre* (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1982).

48   Serge Gruzinski, *La guerre des images de Christophe Colombe à 'Blade Runner'* (Paris: Librairie Arthème Fayard, 1990), English translation: *Images at War: Mexico from Columbus to 'Blade Runner' (1492–2019)*, trans. Heather MacLean (Durham, NC, and London: Duke University Press, 2001); Greenblatt, Stephen, *Marvelous Possessions: The Wonder of the New World* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1991).

49   https://www.thispersondoesnotexist.com (last accessed February 14, 2022).

with algorithms, or even birthed by algorithms when taking into consideration Japan's popular cyberpop icon, Hatsune Miku.[50]

What is the story behind such pictures? What do all the pictures that present real and artificially created people struggling with issues of belonging and detachment tell us? What purpose do these pictures serve? And "what do pictures really want?", to quote the title of a famous essay by W.J.T. Mitchell.[51] Such questions are highly relevant in contemporary culture in which the visual plays an ever-increasingly important role not only with respect to the shaping of societal and individual identities but also regarding their genesis. This volume offers intriguing examinations and explorations of what images reveal when the eyes are effectively engaged and accept the invitation images offer for closer scrutiny, to look beyond the surface.

This volume of essays is divided into six sections. The first section presents three essays that address and reflect on theoretical and methodological aspects of music iconography and visual studies, contributing to current debates. The second section encompasses three papers that analyse matters of belonging, detachment, and musical identities in visual culture from the perspective of courtly and ecclesiastical life, while the six contributions of the third section examine the issues with a view to notation, intertextuality and interarts dialogue. The fourth section including eight papers, focuses on aspects of the fabrication and mechanism of cultural identity and the three essays of the fifth section take a closer look at aspects of belonging, detachment and musical identities as linked to topics of colonialism. The sixth and final section, addresses in five papers issues of identity in the context of subversion and struggle.

In general, all the essays elucidate ways in which visual sources affirm their own powers by treating them not as passive and silent bit parts but rather as independent and active voices.[52] Just as with "identity" however, visual objects are not restricted to only one interpretation.

---

50   For further information on this phenomenon see Rafal Zaborowski, "Hatsune Miku and Japanese Virtual Idols," in *The Oxford Handbook of Music and Virtuality*, ed. Sheila Whiteley and Shara Rambarran (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), 111–128; Stina Marie Hasse Jørgensen, Sabrina Vitting-Seerup, and Katrine Wallevik, "Hatsune Miku: an Uncertain Image," *Digital Creativity* 28, no. 4 (2017): 318–331, doi: 10.1080/14626268.2017.1381625; Maja Mrđenović, "Hatsune Miku: The Subversive Potential of a Participatory-Created Cyberpop Idol," *Kultura*, 169 (2020): 113–129, doi: 10.5937/kultura2069113M; Esperanza Miyake, "I Am a Virtual Girl from Tokyo: Virtual Influencers, Digital-Orientalism and the (Im)materiality of Race and Gender," *Journal of Consumer Culture* 10 (2022), doi: 10.1177/14695405221117195.

51   W.J.T. Mitchell, "What Do Pictures 'Really' Want?," *October* 77, no. 1 (1996): 71–82.

52   Jeffrey F. Hamburger, Introduction to *The Mind's Eye: Art and Theological Argument in the Middle Ages*, ed. Jeffrey F. Hamburger and Anne-Marie Bouché (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2006), 3–10.

★ ★ ★

The editors and authors dedicate this volume to the memory of Dorothea Baumann who passed away unexpectedly on 29 August 2022. She was an exceptional scholar with an enormously broad horizon and a warm-hearted and generous friend.[53] Dorothea's scholarly merits and management achievements were extraordinary in so many different fields and ways. She energetically championed music iconographic research with both her own scholarly contributions (one of the last she was able to accomplish is part of the present volume) as well as with her convincing advocacy for the discipline's recognition and promotion as an earnest and socially-relevant branch of music research.

---

53   See Antonio Baldassarre, "Obituary Dorothea Baumann (1946–2022)," *IMS Newsletter* 9, no. 2 (2022): 15–16.